Cambridge International AS & A Level

HINDUISM **9487/04**

Paper 4 Written Paper **October/November 2023**

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 60

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge International will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge International is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2023 series for most Cambridge IGCSE, Cambridge International A and AS Level components, and some Cambridge O Level components.

This document consists of **12** printed pages.

Generic Marking Principles

These general marking principles must be applied by all examiners when marking candidate answers. They should be applied alongside the specific content of the mark scheme or generic level descriptors for a question. Each question paper and mark scheme will also comply with these marking principles.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 1: Marks must be awarded in line with: • the specific content of the mark scheme or the generic level descriptors for the question • the specific skills defined in the mark scheme or in the generic level descriptors for the question • the standard of response required by a candidate as exemplified by the standardisation scripts.
GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 2: Marks awarded are always **whole marks** (not half marks, or other fractions).
GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 3: Marks must be awarded **positively**: • marks are awarded for correct/valid answers, as defined in the mark scheme. However, credit is given for valid answers which go beyond the scope of the syllabus and mark scheme, referring to your Team Leader as appropriate • marks are awarded when candidates clearly demonstrate what they know and can do • marks are not deducted for errors • marks are not deducted for omissions • answers should only be judged on the quality of spelling, punctuation and grammar when these features are specifically assessed by the question as indicated by the mark scheme. The meaning, however, should be unambiguous.
GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 4: Rules must be applied consistently, e.g. in situations where candidates have not followed instructions or in the application of generic level descriptors.
GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 5: Marks should be awarded using the full range of marks defined in the mark scheme for the question (however; the use of the full mark range may be limited according to the quality of the candidate responses seen).
GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 6: Marks awarded are based solely on the requirements as defined in the mark scheme. Marks should not be awarded with grade thresholds or grade descriptors in mind.

A Level Marking grid

Level	AO1 Knowledge and Understanding	Marks
Level 4	**Explorative with detailed significant knowledge** • Uses a range of detailed and relevant knowledge. • Confident understanding demonstrated through making connections between ideas and development of discussion. • Addresses all aspects of the question. • Exploration of the wider context if relevant.	10 – 12
Level 3	**Explains significance of knowledge** • Uses a range of accurate and relevant knowledge. • Good understanding demonstrated through explanation of significance of knowledge used in developing the discussion. • Addresses most aspects of the question. • Good understanding of the wider context, if relevant.	7 – 9
Level 2	**Range of knowledge partly addressing the question** • Uses a range of knowledge with some accuracy • Demonstrates understanding through use of appropriate knowledge, may be less well developed • Partially addresses the question. • Uneven engagement with the wider context, if relevant.	4 – 6
Level 1	**Limited answer to question with limited knowledge / understanding** • Identifies a limited range of knowledge some of which may not be accurate. • Demonstrates basic understanding • Response is relevant to the topic, but does not directly address the question. • Limited reference to the wider context, if relevant	1 – 3
Level 0	No relevant material to credit.	0

Level	AO2 Analysis and Evaluation	Marks
Level 5	Assesses alternative conclusions with analysis of points view • Analyses the importance and/or strength of different points of view • Uses accurate evidence to support a coherent and well-structured discussion. • Coherent conclusion which evaluates knowledge and points of view and assesses alternative conclusions.	16 – 18
Level 4	Coherent conclusion supported by evidenced points of view • Discusses different points of view in some detail • Uses accurate evidence to support a well-structured discussion. • Coherent conclusion which evaluates knowledge and points of view	12 – 15
Level 3	Clear conclusion with different points of view • Recognises different points of view and discusses at least one in some detail • Uses accurate evidence to support discussion. • Clear conclusion to the question which is linked to a range of knowledge and points of view.	8 – 11
Level 2	Attempts conclusion with a supported point of view • Discusses one point of view • Uses supporting evidence for one or more relevant point. The support may not be wholly relevant or accurate. • Attempts a conclusion to the question which is linked to knowledge and/or a point of view.	4 – 7
Level 1	Basic conclusion with a point of view • States a point of view. • Little or no supporting evidence. • Attempts a basic conclusion.	1 – 3
Level 0	• No relevant material to credit.	0

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	**Explain the relationship between the concepts of varna and jati.** AO1 – Knowledge and understanding. Responses will be marked according to the 12 mark level descriptors (AO1). Candidates might refer to some of the following: Varna literally means 'colour' and jati 'birth group'. Both are sometimes translated as 'caste' which would imply that they are different terms for describing the same thing, however there are distinctions. Varna is probably better translated as 'class'. There are four varnas described in Hindu scripture, originating in the Purusha Sukta. Varna is a means of organising people according to their social functions or occupations. The varnas are brahmins (priests), kshatriyas (warriors), vaishyas (traders) and shudras (servants). However, in the 'caste' system as it has been practised in recent history there has been a fifth group comprising of people outside the scope of the varna system. It is this avarna group and the discrimination and oppression associated with being part of it that leads to concerns that the varna system has been corrupted over time which enables it to be conflated with jati. Jati is closer in meaning to the sociological definitions of 'caste' than the ideal varna system is, being associated with birth and therefore unchangeable. The term does exist in ancient texts and is given as distinct from varna. However, it is less commonly mentioned and not as clearly defined as the varnas are. There are thousands of jati in contemporary India, and the concept crosses religious boundaries. The origins of the system and its development over time are widely disputed with some people regarding it as a development or distortion of varna and others as a separate system that existed in parallel with varna and came to be intertwined over time. Varna are broad categories relating to general areas of social responsibility while jati are far more specifically associated with particular occupations. Jati may also be associated with a particular region, where an area is famous for a particular craft or skill. Many Indian family names derive from jati, for example potters in Bengal have the surname Pal, so anyone with that name either has this as their trade, or has historical links with it. Overall, it is clear that both terms deal with social structure and, perhaps, hierarchies and many people would not see any significant difference between them in terms of the practical realities of Indian society. Scholars would generally agree that differences exist, but what those differences are and how the two concepts interact is more likely to be contested.	12

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	**'Social reformers have had no impact on the "caste" system.' Discuss.**	18
	AO2 – Analysis and evaluation. Responses will be marked according to the 18 mark level descriptors (AO2).	
	Candidates might refer to some of the following:	
	'Social reformers' are individuals who engage in a conscious effort to change society. While religious groups/movements might espouse social change as part of a larger commitment to human good this does not mean that they can be described as being primarily movements for social reform in the context and sense indicated by the syllabus.	
	The phrase 'the caste system' implies something clearly delineated and defined; the fact that this is not the case could be used as the basis for an exploration of why it has proven difficult to dismantle.	
	The Vedic origins of the varna system mean that many Hindus associate at least some elements of 'caste' with the requirements of their religion and would therefore resist a wholesale rejection of it. Social reformers have grappled with this confusion, leading to popular discussion about the varnas being distorted or corrupted. Some Hindu groups involved in social reform, such as the Brahmo Samaj, ultimately rejected the authority of the Vedas although this was arguably more because of the understanding of God they sought to promote rather than because of the social difficulties connected with the varna system.	
	While social reformers were, and are, in general agreement that 'caste-based' discrimination is destructive and needs addressing they did so in different ways, and they sought to achieve different ideals. For example, M K Gandhi was keen to create a unified Hinduism while Dr Ambedkar saw this as an erosion of the distinct identities groups had acquired and created within the historical 'caste' system; he wished to retain these while ensuring all groups within society were treated equally.	
	Success can be measured in different ways and certainly there is some measure of success in terms of the laws of modern India. 'Caste-based' discrimination was outlawed in the Indian Constitution, and steps towards addressing historic imbalances were introduced through various forms of positive discrimination. Since Indian Independence, the courts have upheld contemporary secular values of protecting equality and diversity. However, issues relating to 'caste', particularly the ongoing oppression of dalits, are still of concern. Poverty, lack of education, exploitation and being victims of crime, including violent crime, remain strongly correlated with 'caste' backgrounds. The simple fact that courts are still having to pronounce on such matters argues against the contention that reform has been achieved. Beyond legal questions, issues of negative social attitudes remain. For example, 'inter-caste' marriage might be viewed with disapproval.	

Question	Answer	Marks
2(a)	**Explain how the International Society for Krishna Consciousness (ISKCON) is different to other forms of Hinduism.** AO1 – Knowledge and understanding. Responses will be marked according to the 12 mark level descriptors (AO1). Candidates might refer to some of the following: The International Society for Krishna Consciousness (ISKCON) describes itself as a form of Hinduism within the Gaudiya Vaishnava tradition and it is the main form in which this tradition is known outside India. In keeping with these roots, it is a bhakti tradition, focused on an intense devotion to Krishna as the Supreme Godhead. In common with other bhakti traditions ISKCON practices include murti puja, singing kirtanas and nama japa (repetition of the divine name). There are also differences with other bhakti practices, for example, the manifestation of transcendence in public dancing and singing. In many ways ISKCON can be seen as among the more conservative traditions of Hinduism in, for example, its differentiation of male and female dharma. It may also be seen as taking a more absolute stance on some issues, with bhakti being regarded the only way to achieve moksha. Unmarried devotees may embrace a quasi-monastic communal life, living as brahmacarya. They might also dress as the original sixteenth century followers of Gaudiya Vaishnavism would have done. One place where it differs dramatically from other schools within the same tradition is in its acceptance of devotees from outside the traditional varna system with new members, including non-Hindus, being given Hindu names when they are initiated. This is linked with its actively seeking new devotees; kirtanas are often performed in public places both to express devotion and to attract the attention of potential converts. Similarly, ISKCON advocates preaching and often distributes free books seeking to teach people about the religion. Seva (selfless service) is an important Hindu virtue, and it is strongly emphasised within ISKCON communities. ISKCON can be seen as a fully realised tradition within Hinduism and it could be said that it has 'universalised' Hinduism in a unique way in that it has enabled non-Hindus to engage with the religion away from its Indian roots. It has the express aim of teaching people about the religion, albeit in ISKCON specific forms, and it actively seeks to adapt to international mores and values in ways other Hindu traditions may not have done. It could be said that by presenting itself as a religious tradition and acknowledging the wider religion of Hinduism from which it stems, ISKCON not only teaches about itself but also demonstrates that the different aspects of Hinduism in popular awareness are part of something larger and more complex than these popular understandings might allow.	12

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	**Assess the claim that proselytisation is the main practice of ISKCON.** AO2 – Analysis and evaluation. Responses will be marked according to the 18 mark level descriptors (AO2). Candidates might refer to some of the following: ISKCON does undoubtedly proselytise, meaning that they actively promote their beliefs to non-members in the hope of encouraging conversion. They also distribute copies of the Bhagavad Gita in the local language. Whether or not this can be considered their main practice is more open to debate. ISKCON first became well known outside India because of their public devotional practices; singing hymns, dancing and chanting mantras in public places, which were surprising to many when they first encountered them, and the movement was often criticised in its earlier days for being too obtrusive or aggressive in these practices. However, it can be argued that the nature of these practices makes them acts of worship at least as much as they are attempts to proselytise, and possibly more so since an observer would have to engage in conversation with a devotee or take the literature that may be handed out in order to understand what it is they were witnessing. It is also true though that preaching was strongly advocated by Swami Prabhupada, the founder of ISKCON. He believed preaching Krishna consciousness was the best service that a devotee could offer to the divine. He saw it as a service to humanity, bringing peace to the world and easing the suffering of humanity, implying a connection with proselytisation that Prabhupada did not consider inherent in the term. ISKCON teachings do have a salvific focus, promoting the belief that a life of devotion to Krishna means one is no longer accumulating new karma and that the grace of Krishna will remove the karma built up in previous lifetimes. Proselytisation is not a traditional Hindu practice because there is an assumption that you are born a Hindu. In addition, it is traditional for individual Hindus to search for a guru while proselytisation suggests the opposite. Given these things it could be argued that proselytisation must be central to ISKCON as it is the primary distinction between it and older traditions. However, it could be argued that all the practices promoted by ISKCON are primarily focused on expressing devotion to Krishna with aspects like gaining new converts being peripheral or coincidental rather than an aim or concern.	18

Question	Answer	Marks
3	**Evaluate the claim that Sita and Draupaudi are feminist role models.**	**30**
	AO1 - Knowledge and understanding AO2 - Analysis and evaluation Responses will be marked according to the level descriptors.	
	Candidates might refer to some of the following:	
	Draupadi and Sita are both central female characters in Hindu Epics.	
	Draupadi is in the Mahabharata. She was born fully grown from a sacred fire. She is the wife of all five of the Pandavas; Arjuna won the Svayamvara (contest) held to help her choose a husband but a misunderstanding by his mother led to her instructing Arjuna to share his winnings with his brothers. Each brother has exclusive access to her for a year at a time and she gave each of them a son. She is gambled away in a game of dice by one of her husbands (Yudhisthira), who also loses his own and his brothers' freedom. The winner attempts to publicly humiliate both her and them by stripping her of her clothes, but she is protected by Krishna. Ultimately, she gains the Pandavas' freedom as a boon from the father of Duryodhana, only to be forced into exile with her husbands when Yudhisthira again loses a game of dice. During this exile Draupadi once again receives miraculous aid from Krishna, satisfying hungry guests without food; she is abducted and rescued, assaulted by Kichaka, and sentenced to death when her husbands kills him. Later, when her husbands renounce the world and embark on their journey to heaven, she goes with them and is the first to die on the journey.	
	Sita is the wife of Rama and her part in his story is told in the Ramayana and the Ramacharitamanas. She is said to have been discovered in a freshly ploughed field as a baby, marking her as the daughter of Bhumi (goddess of the earth). She was adopted and raised by Janaka and chose Rama for her husband after a Svayamvara in which he broke a bow that belonged to Shiva. When Rama went into exile and Bharata was made king Sita went with him. She was abducted by Ravana and ultimately rescued by Rama and his companions. She was then required to prove her purity, having spent so long in the possession of Ravana, and did so by walking unharmed through fire. According to the story as told in the Ramayana, this concern about her chastity did not disappear, and the people of Ayodyhya would not accept her as Queen when Rama returned from exile. In this account Sita, now pregnant, was exiled again. After seeing her sons accepted by their father, many years later, Sita asked her mother Goddess to release her from the unjust world and was taken away by Bhumi.	
	Both women fulfil the traditional roles of wife and mother, although Sita does so in a more conventional way than Draupadi, and both show loyalty and devotion to their husbands in spite of great trials. They are thus considered to be exemplary Hindu wives, and both are worshipped as goddesses. However, the qualities which religion has traditionally admired in women are not necessarily those admired by contemporary feminism.	

Question	Answer	Marks
3	Feminism encompasses a range of views relating to equality. These are commonly grounded in the view that society in general privileges the male perspective and accordingly women are routinely disadvantaged. Feminist campaigners have been concerned with women's rights such as the right to be educated, to work outside the home, to vote, to own property and similar. They have also sought to reduce violence against women, to reduce unfair standards in social expectations and norms of behaviour and to enable women to control their own lives and reproductive processes. Both Draupadi and Sita are subjected to assaults and violence of various kinds. Both are royalty and also divine and yet both suffer in the same ways as ordinary women. This could be said to illustrate how widespread this kind of treatment to women is. Their responses are very different however, with Sita largely accepting what happens to her and Draupadi being actively involved in redressing the wrongs against her. Many modern feminists are likely to validate Draupadi's reactions rather than Sita's as the latter could be seen as more passive and associated with traditional feminine values while Draupadi takes an independent stand. However, since Sita goes on to become a single mother, raising two children alone and in exile from her home, she could be seen as an example of a woman living successfully without a man in her life. By contrast, she also accepts the need to prove her purity which could be seen as unacceptable to feminists. It could also be argued that the privileges of royalty mean these women have different courses of action and responses available to them, meaning their experiences cannot really be felt as shared. In addition, both women are also often the only significant female character present and, as such, their experiences occur in isolation which perhaps prevents the sense of shared, collective experience modern feminism often emphasises. The expectations on both women regarding their expected virtues and behaviours are extremely high. The difficulty of living up to such ideals is perhaps part of the point of the stories, but the value to be placed on proving oneself worthy in relation to a narrow and gender-focused range of ideals is debatable. It is also worth noting that feminism is interested in equality and the freedom for women to make choices. Genuinely free choice must include the right to make choices which could be seen as traditional or old-fashioned. Sita's choice to follow Rama into exile could be interpreted as a submissive dependent woman who can't imagine life without her husband, but it could also be interpreted as a woman choosing freely to honour a commitment to her dharma.	

Question	Answer	Marks
4	**'Religious freedom is always part of secularism.'** **Discuss.** AO1 - Knowledge and understanding AO2 - Analysis and evaluation Responses will be marked according to the level descriptors. Candidates might refer to some of the following: Secularism is a position that encourages the separation of religion and the state. It is often adopted with the intention of eliminating religious based discrimination as states with an official state religion may privilege adherents of that religion in various ways. In practice there is a great variety of forms a secular state might take and different kinds of discrimination and/or inequality might result from it. 'Religious freedom' is most commonly understood in terms of human rights, as the right of individuals and communities to express and observe religious beliefs and practices. It may also include the right to change one's religion or beliefs and the right to be part of no religion. Freedom of belief is a narrower but associated concept, which recognises the right of individuals to believe as they choose but not necessarily to engage in open or public practice When a state is described as secular it may mean that there is no official or established state religion, but it is possible to have an established religion and to still consider the political establishment secular in nature. In other words, having a state religion does not automatically amount to being a theocracy, neither does it necessitate that everyone living within that state conforms to that religion. The UK is an example of a state with an established religion that nonetheless regards itself as largely secular and which has a range of laws to protect individual freedom to keep, practise, change or reject one's religion according to personal choice. Equality laws in a state like the UK also seek to ensure that everyone is equal in the eyes of the law and has equal access to services regardless of their religious affiliation or lack thereof. Such a state would consider itself to be supportive of both religious tolerance and religious freedom. However, it can also be argued that secularism promotes an indifference to religious concerns, or an assumption that religion is inherently unequal or discriminatory, and laws intended to promote freedom and equality could be seen as restrictive of some religious activities, limiting freedom of religion in practical terms even if it is supported in principle. Traditional Hindu practices such as open-air cremation might be limited in this way in some countries. In addition, although preventing religious concerns from being written into national laws is meant to ensure no-one is discriminated against, there are religious groups and communities that would judge some secular laws to be harmful, in that they allow things that are considered morally wrong in the religious context. Issues around sexuality, marriage and human rights are common examples.	30

Question	Answer	Marks
4	Protests about this kind of issue can be seen as an expression of both religious freedom - to hold those beliefs - and the more secular freedom of expression. The issue of blasphemy and legal responses to it can complicate attitudes to freedom of expression and social discourse about religious issues. They can also raise intolerance of religion if people come to believe things they value are under threat from religious groups. It could be argued that dissent and disagreement are fundamentals of secularism. Actively anti-religious sentiments form a significant part of public discourse about religion in the contemporary world. Conceptual connections between humanism and secularism may see a reduction in the tolerance of religion and some atheists might well argue against allowing religious freedoms within a secular society, or restricting it to the private sphere, on the basis that religion is harmful to individuals and to society.	